The Art Discovery Group Catalogue

Geert-Jan Koot

Head of the Rijksmuseum Research Library

The Rijksmuseum Member Story on the OCLC website begins like this:

"If you've wandered through an art museum, you know that the highlighted artwork wasn't always the one that spoke to you. Sometimes, the less "important" work made your heart sing. You wanted to know the story behind it. You Googled the title, but in the sea of results, you didn't even find an image. Wikipedia had little biographic information on the artist and almost nothing on the year "your" piece was created. You wanted to learn more. But how?"

Since the year 2010 two developments paved the way to the development of the new type of catalogue that should provide solutions for this kind of questions:

The first one was the cessation of the Getty Research Centre's support for the Bibliography of the History of Art (BHA), which caused the crisis in art bibliography. Through conversations about the concern for international art bibliography funding, art librarians, art historians, publishers and information technologists in the American and European art historical community developed the Future of Art Bibliography (FAB) group, which hosted international meetings to look for new ways of facilitating art historical research collaboratively. It was acknowledged that professional cooperation among scholars, librarians, and publishers is needed. The discovery of resources should be made much easier. We need to take advantage of what already exists digitally, in publishers' catalogues, in websites, in digital information that is available and to identify the gaps in what does not exist or is already discoverable.

It was the theoretical approach of the FAB task force that triggered my mind to think about the intriguing concept which has been formulated as: "A common electronic research index as a power-plant for information research in art history."

The FAB initiative resulted in the need for a discovery environment for discipline specific information and sources. Part of the solution has been *artlibraries.net*, which mines the online databases of [almost 100] participating art libraries. But this system has limitations. This vision to create a new freely available virtual art bibliography emerged at the same time as the

second development, the technical shortcomings of *artlibraries.net* appeared as a result of its popularity and ongoing expansion. Facing the reality that a larger part of the artlibraries.net catalogues are included in the WorldCat database, the starting point for a new information retrieval model was the solid and future-based architecture of WorldCat. In addition, access to "thousands of commercial and freely accessible collections, portals and repositories provided by OCLC" was available through the WorldCat central index. "As a result of this wealth of bibliographic information, we realized that a true discovery tool for art historical research could be realized. We called it _Art Discovery_."

As example served the *AdamNet Group Catalogue,* which is based on the catalogues of the 25 libraries organised as the Amsterdam library consortium AdamNet. The importance of the support of the OCLC EMEA office in the Netherlands developing this AdamNet Group Catalogue concept into a successful working tool was of decisive importance.

Artlibraries.net is a meta search interface based on the technology of the Karlsruhe Virtual Catalogue (VKK), which conducts a simultaneous search in a number of web catalogues. As artlibraries.net does not have its own database, it depends on the availability of target systems. Artlibraries.net produces standardized short-title hit lists.

The WorldCat data harvesting model offers significant advantages over the distributed search model. It enables a single, consolidated result set, better response times and a more robust search service. From the single result set it is possible to display facets for narrowing the result set, the presentation can include thumbnail images and the scope of the display can be varied, from group catalogue to libraries world-wide. With the distributed search model there is a limited number of targets that can be effectively accommodated; this is overcome with the data harvesting model.

Content

Since journal articles are indexed rather scarcely in library catalogues, this junction of relevant sources will enrich remarkably the discovery of bibliographic information. The meta-data pool referring more than 200 million articles from over 96,000 journal titles (from all disciplines). 78,000 titles are accessible without authentication and no subscription of the full-text access is needed. The bibliographic meta-data of the rest, about 18.000 journals, are accessible with

restrictions (authentication, normally IP-based). In certain cases these sources will be visible when searches are being processed in IP-domains with the related subscription. Outside of these domains the access will be denied.

After an encouraging response to invitations sent out to artlibraries.net members to participate in this project in 2013, and several meetings with OCLC, it was agreed that it was desirable to get the project up and running as soon as possible with the libraries already in WorldCat. As a result 60 libraries from 12 countries signed the agreement. Most of these libraries were included in Art Discovery by the official launch date of 1 May, 2014. Of this total of 60 art libraries, 24 libraries belong to 3 consortia and networks.

Why, if your results are already in WorldCat do you need to join Art Discovery? It does look like an extra layer of bureaucracy and costs that a lot of smaller or less financially endowed libraries would stay out of even though their holdings would be a huge asset. There are several reasons why libraries should join. The ideological reason is to join forces with other art libraries worldwide to build on this collaborative bibliographic tool for art related research and make the range of coverage as broad as possible. Another reason is to make your collections more visible for art historians. A leading study pointed out the specific desire of many scholars for a single discipline-based research tool, as I will explain later. In my 25 years of experience as librarian of the Rijksmuseum Research Library, curators and conservators in the museum rarely search separate bibliographic databases like Art Index, BHA and IBA. They simply forget about their existence, they do not remember were to find them, or it takes too much effort. Joining Art Discovery is all about adding value to your collections.

Many world leading art libraries joined the discovery tool, such as the National Art Library in London, the Watson Library at the Metropolitan Museum of Art New York, the Getty Research Library, the Rijksmuseum Research Library, several art libraries in Australia and Japan, the Marquand Library of Art and Archaeology at Princeton University and consortia as IRIS in Florence and NYARC consisting of the New York libraries of the Museum of Modern Art, The Brooklyn Museum, and The Frick Art Reference Library. Late 2014, the one and a half million records of the four German Kubikat libraries have been added as well. But also smaller libraries became member, such as the libraries of the Accademia di Architettura in Mendrisio, the Kunsthaus Zürich, both in Switzerland, and the Albertina in Vienna, Austria.

Organization and membership

The Art Discovery Project has been developed by an international project group within the context of the Future of Art Bibliography initiative, with the members of the artlibraries.net committee acting as the core taskforce.

The relation to OCLC should be made clear. Art Discovery is a product of the international art libraries community, managed by the taskforce, powered by WorldCat. Art Discovery is not a service provided by OCLC, but it is using the infrastructure developed for WorldCat. The libraries included in the group catalogue are proposed by the taskforce and agreed by the community. As a result of using the infrastructure developed for WorldCat, libraries first have to sign an agreement with OCLC and secondly pay an annual subscription fee and a one-time set-up fee to join Art Discovery.

The future prospect

Sixty art libraries joining the discovery tool is not bad for a start. We expect many more art libraries willing to participate. Thanks to the generous gifts from the Samuel H. Kress Foundation and the Getty Research Centre, the records of 12 libraries will be uploaded during 2015. Since the launch in May 2014, we received letters of interest from another 16 libraries and one network from 9 different countries and 4 continents.

The project team will also identify and prioritize important art-related databases, journals, and other sources that require group subscriptions in order to be delivered through the Art Discovery Catalogue. Databases to which only some individual libraries have subscriptions cannot be included in Art Discovery. However, the number of free accessible sources is so high and comprehensive that only in a few exceptional cases negotiations with providers will be needed.

Furthermore, repositories of interest and with a relationship to our discipline like image collections, museum archives and so on can be integrated in the discovery environment when certain technical and legal requirements are satisfied. Some local catalogues for instance the Arcade Catalogue of the NYARC libraries contains thousands of records for photo-archive images of works of art and documentation files which are not in WorldCat. It might be of great

importance to add these records. In support of this effort, OCLC has developed the *WorldCat Digital Collection Gateway*, a web-based, self-service tool that enables institutions to control harvesting of metadata for their open access digital collections into WorldCat. Metadata added to WorldCat through the Gateway will gain higher visibility by being freely available for discovery in WorldCat.org and in all of WorldCat's syndications and views, including the Art Discovery Group Catalogue.

Great effort has been put in promoting this new tool for art historical bibliographic research. Since the launch in Washington during the ARLIS/NA Conference, May 2014, accompanied by press releases in several languages, a lecture and a reception, several taskforce members gave presentations in Manchester at the ARLIS/UK Conference, and during the IFLA Section of Art Preconference in Paris, and on the occasion of the main IFLA Conference in Lyon. OCLC supported Art Discovery furthermore by publishing a Rijksmuseum member story on its web site, and by producing a 2.5 minute video-clip which is available on YouTube, also embedded in the 2014 Annual Report. The video clip has been shown on many occasions all over the world.

The IFLA Section of Art Libraries endorsed the project during the Lyon standing committee meetings. Many news clippings based on the official press release have been published, not only in library news bulletins and blogs but also in newsletters of art historians and curators such as Codart, the international network for curators of art from the Low Countries.

Use and reviews

The first reviews are positive, although doubts have been expressed by scholars and subject specialists because of the lack of scope, the limitations of subject specific searches and the multiple listing of the same article records.

On the occasion of the 6th artlibraries.net members meeting in Copenhagen, October 2014, Jan Simane demonstrated the importance of the interrelation of metadata for the quality of retrieval results in his lecture *Art Discovery Group Catalogue, Final Goal or Starting Point?* Jan Simane explained the consequences of the gap between the potential of the discovery infrastructure on the one hand and the data we are providing for new services on the other. "The high degree of redundancy in subject descriptions reduces even further the usefulness

of these indicators for both faceting and relevance ranking. … It is the interaction of the data, and not its mere aggregation, that is so decisive for the discovery experience in an environment like [the] WorldCat. … The results would be more accurate, relevant and easier to process if the filtering principles of the discovery tool were more efficiently supported by corresponding data types. In this respect the Art Discovery Group Catalogue is indeed a starting point."

Google and other web indexing agents are unable to find the home page of Art Discovery. The reason why the Group Catalogue itself is not findable is the existence of a tag in every WorldCat Local and Group Catalogue which tells indexing engines (like Google) not to index them. If all the individual (sub) sites would be indexed, the whole of WorldCat would be indexed by web robots a couple of thousand times. The best solution would be to get a domain for Art Discovery to use for search engine optimisation The domain registered is *artdiscovery.net*. [The number of visits from June until December 2014 is almost 5000 over 214 days, which is about 25 visits daily.]

The dedicated website for Art Discovery is currently being developed by the Gulbenkian Foundation in Lisbon. The Art Discovery Group Catalogue search box will be embedded in its home page. Highly needed information about coverage and search strategies, and how to join the project will become available through this website. In the meantime OCLC has been working hard to redesign the user interface and experience for their discovery services, including Art Discovery. The result of this completely make over is a much nicer discovery experience which is device independent and offers advanced search features, adjustable filters, customized lists, and several ways to connect and share.

Added value

The first goal has been to find a stable, sustainable, and above all functional platform to allow unified searching of the bibliographic data from art libraries worldwide. While the core of the libraries in the Art Discovery Group Catalogue is from the artlibraries.net group, the benefit of this move to the OCLC WorldCat platform is how scalable it is. Libraries that were not members of the artlibraries.net can now become part of the group catalogue, and even libraries such as the Marquand Library of Art and Archeology at Princeton University and the Avery

Architectural and Fine Arts Library, Columbia University will be found where previously in artlibraries.net their holdings were not able to be included for technical reasons. Secondly, an important effect is the remarkably higher speed of obtaining results. At the same time the discovery process can be enriched with additional sources like bibliographic databases, full-text repositories, and image collections. This results in lists of hits remarkably richer than in the artlibraries.net environment.

It's difficult to know exactly who the global audience for Art Discovery is, but a recent publication from Ithaka S+R called *Supporting the Changing Research Practices of Art Historians* provides some insight. This study underscores the desire of many scholars for discipline-based research tools. Another conclusion is that the ability of researchers to borrow materials from a wide network through established lending agreements is very important, as is the ability to use multiple libraries in a geographic region. The better availability of various collection types including auction catalogues, rare books, articles, ephemera, curatorial records, photo archives is also mentioned in this study.

How valuable such a discipline-specific view into the larger WorldCat pool can be, will be proven over the next few years. We are hopeful that we will be able to expand the breadth of the group catalogue over time, both in the number of participating libraries, but also by adding on certain discipline-specific tools and more digital collections in order to move toward the vision of a central and global discovery system for art historical bibliography. Those 60 libraries from 12 countries have already signed up to participate seems a strong vote of confidence that this project might be on the right track. I strongly believe that with bibliographical and digital repositories expanding exponentially, there need to be technical solutions to help researchers find trusted information. It is possible that if Art Discovery is successful and keeps evolving, it could relieve the need for libraries to purchase and implement expensive and untested commercial discovery products.

Thank you for your attention.

Summary Report on "The Future of Art Bibliography in the 21st Century" meetings. April 20th and 21st, 2010, New York City.

www.getty.edu/research/scholars/research_projects/fab/reports/ny2010_04.pdf

Adamnet Group Catalogue: http://adamnet.worldcat.org/

Artlibraries.net: http://artlibraries.net/

WorldCat database: http://worldcat.org/

.

The Art Discovery Group Catalogue is freely available: http://artlibraries.worldcat.org/

WorldCat® Discovery Services, *Content available through WorldCat Discovery Services*

https://oclc.org/content/dam/oclc/worldcat-discovery/contentlist.xls

Updated list of current participating libraries: http://library.rijksmuseum.nl/ArtDiscovery.htm

Updated list of the project team members: http://library.rijksmuseum.nl/ArtDiscovery.htm
Initiating artlibraries.net committee members: Geert-Jan Koot (Library of the Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam, The Netherlands); Wendy Fish (Library Royal Institute of British Architects, London, Great Britain); Véronique Goncerut Estèbe (Bibliothèque d'art et d'archéologie des Musées d'art et d'histoire de la Ville de Genève, Geneva, Switzerland); Rüdiger Hoyer (Library of the Zentralinstitut für Kunstgeschichte, Munich, Germany); Deborah Kempe (Library of the Frick Collection, New York, USA); Paulo Leitão (Library of the Gulbenkian Foundation, Lisbon, Portugal); Michael Rocke (Biblioteca Berenson, Villa I Tatti - The Harvard University Center for Italian Renaissance Studies, Florence, Italy); Kathleen Salomon (The Getty Research Institute, Los Angeles, USA); Jan Simane (Library of the Kunsthistorisches Institut in Florenz, Max-Planck-Institut, Florence, Italy)

Fees for joining the Art Discovery Group Catalogue (ADGC). In order to participate in the Art Discovery Group Catalogue, libraries must have their bibliographic data in the WorldCat

database and qualify for WorldCat on FirstSearch or in EMEA visibility in WorldCat.org and continue those agreements.

A. Annual subscription fee for adding records to ADCC

Categories 1 and 2 = libraries that meet all prerequisites through existing agreements with OCLC:

Collection size	EUR	USD	YEN	AUD	GBP
< 10,000	362	489	38,157	543	308
< 200,000	466	631	49,056	707	399
> 200,000	673	909	70,862	1,010	576

Category 3 = libraries that have no current agreement for WorldCat on FirstSearch or (in EMEA) an agreement for visibility in WorldCat.org:

Collection size	EUR	USD	YEN	AUD	GBP
< 10,000	880	1,188	92,667	1,320	748
< 200,000	984	1,328	103,565	1,485	838
> 200,000	1,087	1,470	114,473	1,636	924

This fee only includes participation in the WorldCat Group Catalog. It does not include WorldCat on FirstSearch, it does not include cataloguing and does not include a metadata conversion or batch load.

B. One-time set-up fee for adding records to ADGC

EUR	USD	YEN	AUD	GBP
310	418	32,652	465	264

Letters of interest for joining Art Discovery Group Catalogue received from (May-December 2014):

Amon Carter Museum of American Art, Fort Worth, Texas, USA

Ringling Museum of Art Library in Sarasota, Florida, USA

New York Public Library, New York, USA

Cornell University, Ithaca, New York, USA

Museum of Fine Arts, Houston, Texas, USA

Tate Gallery, London, UK

University of the Arts London, UK

National Gallery of Art, London, UK

Österreichische Galerie Belvedere, Vienna, Austria

Canadian Centre for Architecture, Montréal, Québec, Canada

Prado Museum Library, Madrid, Spain

Cité de l'architecture et du patrimoine, Bibliothèque, Paris, France

Terra Foundation of American Art (Europe), Paris, France

Anet, a consortium of 20 academic libraries in Antwerp, Belgium

Museum of Modern Art, Tokyo, Japan

Pinacoteca Sao Paulo, Brazil

Coverage of art related databases in Art Discovery Group Catalogue

Art Index (75% of ISSN)

Art Index Full Text (75% of ISSN)

Art Index Retrospective (no known coverage)

Artbibliographies Modern (no known coverage)

DAAI: Art and Design Index (no known coverage)

Avery Index (no known coverage)

Bibliography of the History of Art (no known coverage)

International Bibliography of Art (no known coverage)

JSTOR (100% of records)

AskART (no known coverage)

Index to 19th Century American Art Periodicals (no known coverage)

SCIPIO (100% of records)

Oxford Art Online (100% of records)

Getty Provenance Index (no known coverage)

ASCO Art Sales Catalogues Online (no known coverage)

Artprice.com (no known coverage)

Invaluable (formerly Artfact Pro) (no known coverage)

ARTstor (no known coverage)

Bridgeman Art (no known coverage)

Art Museum Image Gallery (no known coverage)

CAMIO (100% of records)

Google Cultural Institute (no known coverage)

New website designed for the Art Discovery Group Catalogue

http://artdiscovery.net

At the time of writing not yet available.

Prototype of the new discovery interface:

http://artlibraries.on.worldcat.org/discovery

By the time of the publication of this article the prototype might be accepted and available:

http://artlibraries.worldcat.org/discovery

OCLC Products and Services, *WorldCat® Digital Collection Gateway, a Self-Service Tool for Uploading the Metadata of your Digital Content to WorldCat*

https://oclc.org/digital-gateway.en.html

OCLC Member Stories, *Rijksmuseum Facilitate Research through Group Catalogs*

http://www.oclc.org/member-stories/rijksmuseum.en.html

Press release 1 May, 2014: http://oclc.org/news/releases/2014/201415dublin.en.html
Video clip 26 August 2014: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Wzg8wqw7e58
A shorter version was embedded on the second page of the *OCLC 2013-2014 Annual Report*:
http://oclc.org/en-US/annual-report/2014/our-members.html

Ars Hoya, a blog from Georgetown University Library opens with: "The biggest art catalogue in the world. This May [2014] a federated search catalogue exclusively for art debuted in the US. The Art Discovery Group Catalogue is huge, free, and works equally well for the research needs of both undergraduates or the advanced researcher." https://blogs.commons.georgetown.edu/ajs299/2014/05/28/the-biggest-art-catalogue-in-the-world/

Codart ezine, *New Art Discovery Group Catalogue launches. International group leads project to bring together art library catalogues in WorldCat,* Wednesday, 14 May 2014

http://www.codart.nl/news/1086/

Martien Versteeg, Het drie vakken gebied, UBA-blog voor ACW, CI en KG (University of Amsterdam Library blog) *Posts Tagged 'Art Discovery Group Catalogue'* 23 May 2014. http://martien128.wordpress.com/tag/art-discovery-group-catalogue/

Jan Simane, *Art Discovery Group Catalogue, Final Goal or Starting Point?* Lecture given at the 6th artlibraries.net meeting, Copenhagen, October 10-12, 2014 http://artlibraries.net/archiv_dokumente/dokumente/Simane_Kopenhagen2014publ.pdf

Ithaka S+R, *Supporting the Changing Research Practices of Art Historians*, 2014 http://www.sr.ithaka.org/sites/default/files/reports/SR_Support-Changing-Research-ArtHist_20140429.pdf

Author credit

Geert-Jan Koot

Head of the Rijksmuseum Research Library

Museumstraat 1

P.O. Box 7488

NL-1070 DN Amsterdam, Netherlands

Email: g.koot@rijksmuseum.nl

Project manager of the Art Discovery Group Catalogue on behalf of the international working group within the context of the Future of Art Bibliography initiative, with the members of the artlibraries.net committee acting as the taskforce.

Lecture for the EMEA Regional Council 2015, 10th February, Florence (4.15 – 5.15 pm)